

**Canadian Theological Society Annual Meeting  
Congress 2016  
University of Calgary  
May 30 - June 1, 2016**

<b>Monday May 30, 2016</b>		
<b>Time</b>	<b>Trailer B 101</b>	<b>Trailer B 102</b>
8:45 a.m. - 9:00 a.m.	Welcome!	
9:00 a.m. - 9:40 a.m.	“Toward a Theology of the Emancipation for the Caribbean-“ Vincent Esprit	“Improperly Basic: Lacan, Reformed Epistemology and Presuppositionalism - Yuri Forbes-Petrovich
9:40 - 10:20 a.m.	“Theology of the Heart of Jesus as Key to Pope Francis’ Call to Mercy” - Peter Ngyuen	An Unconditional Community - Joshua Culling
10:20 -10:40	Break	
10:40 - 11:20	Agamben and Theology: Providence, Capitalism and the Theodical Machine - Adam Smith	Mary, Marry and Menstruation: Sexual Purity in the Church- Doris Kieser
11:20 - 12:00	Exhausting the Theologico-Political: Toward a Messianic Deactivation of Global Capitalism -Tapi Garba	Loving Our Neighbours as Ourselves: Participatory Art as Social - Samantha Cavanagh
12:00 - 1:30 p.m.	Lunch	
1:30 - 3:00 p.m.	Jay Newman Lecture: Michael Ruse	
3:00 - 3:40 p.m.	Ecological Theology and Evolutionary Theory: Pierre Teilhard de Chardin’s Mystical Engagement with Evolution - Rachel Knight-Messenger	It’s Kind of Like Dating Around: Why Young Mennonites are Not Getting Baptized - Peter Epp
3:40 - 3:55	Break	
3:55 - 5:15	CTS Annual General Meeting	
5:15 - 7:30	Break	
7:30 - 9:30 p.m.	Joint Lecture - Mary Jo Leddy Earth Sciences 162	

<b>Tuesday May 31, 2016</b>
-----------------------------

Time	Trailer B 101	Trailer B 102
9:00 a.m. - 9:40 a.m.	<i>Naw'qinwixw</i> : Theology of Inculturation of the Faith - Catherine Caufield	Ecclesiology Beyond the Borders of the Church - John Berard
9:40 - 10:20 a.m.	<i>Taashikawin</i> and the Church that Lost its Place - Deanna Zantingh	Bringing Our Gifts: Equity, Mutuality and Intergenerational Solidarity in Congregations - Cory Seibel
10:20 -10:40	Break	
10:40 - 11:20	Divine Kenosis as Discipleship: Building the Community Out of Mercy - Jean-Pierre Fortin	Don't Frack with Our Water: Conflicting or Converging Narratives in Traditionalist Indigenous and Christian Opposition - Derek Simon
11:20 - 12:00	Justification by Grace and Cultural/Religious Pluralism - Don Schweitzer	Examining Pathways of Theological Engagement in Water Ethics in the Anthropocene - Tom McAuley
12:00 - 1:30 p.m.	Lunch	
1:30 - 3:00 p.m.	Panel: The Challenge of Religious Freedom: Past, Present and Future	
3:00 - 4:00 p.m.	Presidential Address: Cristina Vanin	
4:00 - 4:10	Break	
4:10 - 4:50	Christian Martyrdom and the Unity of the Church - Jeremy Bergen	The Preferential Option for the Poor and Grounds for Interfaith Solidarity with Indigenous People in Canada - Benjamín Luján
4:50 - 5:30	The Good of the City: Churches Working Together in Edmonton - Carol Penner	Rainbow of Redemption: A Metaphorical Supplement to Contextual Theology - Jesse Smith

<b>Wednesday June 1, 2016</b>
-------------------------------

Time	Trailer B 101	Trailer B 102
9:00 a.m. - 9:40 a.m.	The Challenge of Love: A Social and Theological Appraisal of the Situation of Catholic Schools in Alberta - Brett Fawcett	Creative Energy: The Role of the Erotic in Response to Approaches to Ecological Crises” - Michael Ross
9:40 - 10:20 a.m.	Marriage Equality: Articulating the “More” in a Christian Theology of Marriage - Stephen Martin	Slow Down, Pay Attention: Putting Ivan Illich’s Energy Ethics in Theological Perspective - Graham Baker
10:20 -11:00 a.m.	What Will the Neighbours Think? The Problems with Judging Scandal in Catholic Schools - Graham McDonough	If Your Brother Sins Against you: Fossil Fuel Divestment and Ecclesial Ethics - Dane Neufeld
11:00 a.m.	Closing	

## Paper Abstracts

Monday May 30, 2016

### 1. Towards a theology of Emancipation for the Afro-Caribbean? Vincent Esprit, Mission of St Francis Xavier

From the Middle Ages to the 16<sup>th</sup> Century Anselm of Canterbury, in departing from the early Church's relational hermeneutic, developed the doctrine of satisfaction and to a lesser extent that of substitution. Anselm's perspective intimately associated with the plantation economy and "*slavery*" has been one of the more prominent foundations that attempts to define the ethos of the Afro-Caribbean peoples. His soteriology rooted in a historical and cultural feudal context argues for the inability of humanity to repay an original existential debt owed to God. This has not only influenced the Church's soteriological arguments but also a correspondingly lasting influence on the Caribbean's Afro-Caribbean population – theological, psychological and economical. If the cross becomes the archetypal moment in history that defines Anselm's soteriological perspective, then it is probably an opportune time to revisit this moment. Does Anselm's soteriology adequately inform the Afro-Caribbean Christian in his/her efforts at overcoming the above mentioned consequences of "*colonization*?" How does Hannah Arendt's political thought – "action," provide new perspectives for the Afro-Caribbean, by reinterpreting Jesus' disposition upon the cross? How can Jürgen Moltmann's Theology of Hope inform this theological argument? This paper seeks to provide new perspectives that can eventually lead to a theology of emancipation which can inform the Afro-Caribbean and by extension its indigenous population, in their efforts at "*overcoming*" their colonial past. The presentation will be in the form of a twenty minute presentation from the written text, to be followed by a corresponding time allotted to questions received from the audience.

### 2. "Improperly Basic": Lacan, Reformed Epistemology, and Presuppositionalism - Yuri Forbes-Petrovich, University of Western Ontario

The theological debate between reformed epistemology and presuppositional theology contrasts two analogous theological positions. God is, in these two doctrines, properly basic to believe in and cannot be arrived at from a secular basis. However, the accusations of arbitrariness and reducing God to the property of existence are insolvent between the two thoughts. In this study I turn to the thought of Jacques Lacan and his followers (Slavoj Žižek and Alain Badiou) to suggest, as an emendation, that belief in God is basic but also epistemically and ontologically "improper." God precedes existence and universal necessity and so must be understood as basic even to them.

Reformed theology considers belief in God "properly basic": ultimately a rational and primary belief instead of being a matter of faith. However, this position offers a merely a negative apology for Christianity and, despite Plantinga's objections, cannot address Bertrand Russell's teapot argument. The stronger form of reformed epistemology, Van Til's

presuppositionalism, is deftly able to respond to this critique as it addresses a particularly Christian orientation as presupposed in all rational arguments. While critiques of presuppositionalism as a form of fideism have long stood, it is only within the recent philosophical discussions of contingency that Van Til's thought can be argued to be fundamentally faith-based. Quentin Meillassoux's *After Finitude*, for instance, maintains that the continuity between thinking and being is itself fideistic and so any "properly basic" belief, including Plantinga's or Van Til's, cannot have ontologically necessary implications.

As opposed to the polemical arguments formed by Plantinga and William Craig Lane about the scriptural basis for either position, this study will turn towards the thought of Jacques Lacan to understand the basis of this debate. Of particular relevance is Slavoj Žižek's notion of the "unknown known," which is essential to interrogate the epistemic status of belief in God as properly basic. Arguments of God's necessity presume a natural theology; it is only in contingent revelation that God is not reduced to an ontological category, as Plantinga argues occurs within presuppositionalism. God is removed as a logical or ontological basis for epistemology and is rendered as an Event, as Alain Badiou defines in *Being and Event*, which provides the Christian basis for considerations of warrant (Plantinga) and presupposition directly (Lane). God is neither arbitrarily selected nor a logical category. Instead, God is the occurrence of existence and salvation as strictly basic, but ontologically "improper."

### **3. Theology of the Heart of Jesus as Key to Pope Francis' Call for Mercy" - Peter Nguyen, Regis College**

Three years into his pontificate, much has been said about Pope Francis' call for mercy. Calling attention to Divine mercy is seen as the cornerstone of his papacy. Indeed, Francis has inaugurated the Jubilee Year of Mercy, so that we may heal wounds and bring God to others. In his book, *The Name of God Is Mercy*, Francis says, "mercy is God's identity card." Moreover, in an address from his first year in the papacy, he states, "The Heart of Jesus is the ultimate symbol of God's mercy . . . [This] mercy is not just a sentiment: indeed, it is a force that gives life, that raises humanity up!" This paper proposes that a key to understanding the Pope's call for a more merciful church is encountered in devotion to the Heart of Jesus.

The Sacred Heart of Jesus in Jesuit spirituality is a crucial devotion. The Jesuits were the first to promote devotion to the Heart of Jesus around the world. They were also accused of heresy for promoting the notion that Jesus' Heart was a permanent source of mercy. At some point, however, the devotion devolved into a saccharine and hyper-individualistic act. Pedro Arrupe, the 28<sup>th</sup> General of the Jesuits, tried to retrieve the devotion. He stated that Ignatian spirituality and devotion to the Jesus' Heart have practically grown up together.

The paper first examines Francis' writings on mercy. Then, it explores Arrupe's writings on the Heart of Jesus. Arrupe recognizes the centrality of the devotion in the formation of a communitarian love and of a church that does justice. His insights on the devotion as it relate to mercy will illuminate Francis' summon for mercy and a church as a field hospital. In doing so, the paper opens up a restrictive vision of mercy, which emerges from a concept of law and is usually applied to a person condemned by the law. Quite the contrary, far from

mercy being associated with what Pilate did not grant Christ, mercy within the Jesuit tradition of the Sacred Heart demonstrates that mercy is primary, justifying the law, revealing what is just. For the law, like the Sabbath, is made for humankind and not humankind for the law or the Sabbath.

This paper is part of a project to reconnect spirituality with theology that does justice by means of devotion to the Heart of Jesus.

#### **4. An Unconditional Community - Joshua Culling, Concordia University of Edmonton**

What is community? If we were to struggle toward a definition of community, would it not implicitly contain a quality that divides the insider from the outsider? Would we be able to establish a definition that does not pride the identity of the insider from that of the outsider? Can we conceive of a community that is something more than, following Derrida, a fortification against the outsider (the other)? In the madness that is the Kingdom of God, John D. Caputo touches on a community defined not by its clear division of insider and outsider, but by a “holy undecidability” that keeps the community open and denies the safety of fortification. Such a community is lacking in that strong identity that tends to give it shape. It is a community without community—an unconditional community. In this work, I will trace the contours of Caputo’s thoughts on community in order to glimpse a community otherwise; a community outside common conception. Caputo does not clearly define a vision of this community, and I will not take on the task of constructing one for him. Rather, in fidelity to his project, I will mark out several signposts that lead us into the space between insider and outsider, to a conception of community marked by the event of Hospitality. The result of this exploration of Caputo’s project will not establish a new community. It will not outline the shape of an ideal community—a utopian society. The result, instead, will loosen our strong communities (those that exist, that we inhabit, that are fortified) as they open up to the impossible call of the Kingdom of God.

#### **5. Agamben and Theology: Providence, Capitalism, and the Theodical Machine - Adam Smith, McGill University**

In the fifteenth-century, the French theologian Jacques-Bénigne Bossuet proactively argued that God fashioned the world as if God were absent from it. Providence makes it appear that God governs the world as if the world governs itself. In his 2007 treatise *Il Regno e la Gloria*, the Italian philosopher Giorgio Agamben traces the contemporary form of power – the logic of governance – to the classically formulated doctrine of providence. For theologians, God reigns indirectly over the world, working opaquely through creatures themselves, rather than violently usurping their creaturely wills. The paradigmatic secular form of this doctrine, Agamben argues, is found in Adam Smith’s metaphor of the ‘invisible hand’. Functioning under a secularized providential logic, capitalism is thus able to subsume any eventuality as collaterally directed toward ever increasing economic beatitude.

Using Agamben, I argue that only by understanding the theological antecedents of the invisible hand can one understand capitalism as a self-justifying theodical machine. That is, contemporary capitalism functions as a ‘secularized’ version of providence, such that every eventuation of the economic order is understood to be a result internal to its logic and processions, rather than demonstrating the limits of capitalism or the neoliberal order. It is my contention that only by disconnecting capitalist political economy from the doctrine of

providence will we be able to see the results of capitalism as destructive and anarchic, rather than as inscrutably (and providentially) ordered toward positive and beneficent ends. It is in this way that we can make space for the possibility of an alternative not governed by the machine of theodicy and the self-perpetuating justification of the present economic order.

### **6. Mary, Marry, and Menstruation: Sexual Purity in the Catholic Tradition - Doris Kieser, Saint Joseph's College, University of Alberta**

Catholic tradition has portrayed Mary, the Virgin Mother of God, as a model to women in the Church in various ways. Her obedience to God's will, her purity of heart and body, and her quiet ministry in the shadow of her son, each depict womanhood as indelibly connected to a particular femininity, most recently adopted in the Church's anthropological understanding of male/female complementarity. Our intercessor with Christ, Mary cuts a complex figure in female consciousness as both virgin and mother. The reality for females of faith, however, is not both/and, but either/or. Each of these two models for females circumscribe sexuality by the role of the woman in the world, while both of them project a female sexuality devoid of menstruation. By depicting female sexuality in relation to a social role (virgin/non-sexual or mother/sexually reproductive), our theology effectively disembodies female sexuality through its limited portrayal of Mary. In this way, female sexuality is also sanitized, categorized, and purified.

In this paper, I disturb such a portrayal of Mary and, effectively, purity and female sexuality. First, I explore some prominent, relatively recent depictions of Mary (e.g., Hans Urs von Balthazar, Pope John Paul II, and Elizabeth Johnson), in search of the body of the Mother of God. Second, I note that the two social roles of virgin and mother ignore a significant female population of the Christian church; non-consecrated, non-married, nulliparous females are virtually invisible in a disembodied sexuality constructed around the Virgin Mother. Third, I turn to the female phenomenon of menstruation as one means of grounding female sexuality squarely within the bodies of females, and forwarding a sexual theology that takes seriously female flourishing in the body of Christ. I hope to contribute to an expanding sexual theology that recognizes sex, gender, and identity as complex and graced.

This paper is part of a larger, ongoing investigation into notions of *purity* as they pertain to females, sexuality, and theology in the Catholic Christian tradition.

### **7. Exhausting the Theologico-political: Towards a Messianic deactivation of Global Capitalism - Tapji Garba, The University of Winnipeg**

In 2012, a special issue of *American Quarterly* entitled 'Race, Empire, and the crisis of the Subprime' was published. In the introduction to the journal, Denise Ferreira Da Silva and Paula Chakravartty argue that Global capitalism rests upon the production of African and indigenous populations as subjects lacking the capacity to participate in the Global economy. This 'incapacity' (which is inseparable from slavery, coloniality and racialization) operates as the justification for the unpayable debts placed upon African and indigenous populations, and the inclusion of these populations in the global economy not as subjects,

but as capital to be accumulated. The unpayable debts placed upon these communities is central to the operation to the 'accumulation by dispossession' that operates in Euro-American societies. What Da Silva and Chakravartty's work highlights is that modern subjectivity is 1) Specifically Western European 2) A prerequisite for participation in the global economy.

Drawing on the work of J. Kameron Carter and Sylvia Wynter, I argue that the racial logic of global capitalism comes into being as a theologico-political invention. Furthermore, I argue that it is still with us in secular form, and so Race and global capitalism ought to be important topics in contemporary political theology. In conclusion, I want to suggest how political theology can be re-configured, by articulating a messianic approach to contemporary global capitalism. Drawing on Hortense Spillers and Walter Benjamin, I argue that the political categories of the 'proper citizen' and 'proper subject', and the operations of racialization and dispossession must be deactivated.

### **8. Loving our Neighbours as Ourselves: Participatory Art as Social Transformation - Samantha Cavanagh, Emmanuel College**

In this paper, I explore the art critical field of participatory art – that is, social artworks that are created collaboratively – from the lens of liberative Christian feminist theo-ethics. Because participatory art functions in the liminal space between art and the social, it is positioned particularly well for facilitating an embodied and implicating criticality. In contemporary artworks that ask their audience to enliven, and sometimes co-create, a work, I propose that there is the potential for participants to critically appraise naturalized and unjust social relations that exist outside of the artwork. I suggest that specific manifestations of participatory art create the opportunity for acting towards action that I interpret through the Christian moral norm of neighbour love, understood as responsible care of strangers and familiars, including the commitment to subvert the structural evils that harm these strangers and familiars, and envision and live towards alternatives. I draw on the work of Cynthia Moe-Lobeda and Iris Marion Young to develop this understanding of the moral norm of neighbour love.

Of course, participatory art does not always enable these transformative possibilities. Demonstrating how and when it does is complicated, in large part because the relationship between aesthetics and ethics, and art and theo-ethics in particular, is open to innumerable interpretations. To navigate this sticky terrain, I use Jacques Rancière's claim that some artworks can function *dissensually* – that is, that some creations are able to generate a sensible fissure in *what is* so that space is made for *what else could be* – to argue for a particular model of *how* participatory art inspires moral action. I reject common arguments that rely on art's capacities for more heavy-handed exposure to, or edification of, social inequities, or for its creation of micro-utopia's, instead arguing that participatory artwork can lead towards the social changes that neighbour love insists upon by destabilizing what we take for granted to be true and static, thereby offering the opportunity for participants to become freshly critical of the cultural norms and destructive power structures that harm self and neighbour. Amy Spiers and Catherine Ryan's participatory performance piece *Nothing to See Here* (March, 2014) provides the framework in my argument for demonstrating how a shared embodied and aesthetic landscape



provides room for participants to develop the critical moral vision required for loving our neighbours as ourselves.

---

**Jay Newman Lecture. Darwinism as Religion: The View from Literature. Michael Ruse, Florida State University**

In 1927, Julian Huxley – grandson of Thomas Henry Huxley and older brother of Aldous Huxley – published a little book called *Religion without Revelation*. Huxley stood in a tradition, that began with his grandfather and that continues down to today with such people as Edward O. Wilson. It is one that rejects Christianity and turns to a rival religion of Darwinism – a kind of world philosophy based on the work of the English naturalist Charles Darwin. In this talk, I shall explore the nature of this secular religion, looking not at science but at literature – poetry and fiction. This talk neither praises nor condemns – just stands in awe at how diligently the Church Fathers have labored to articulate and promote their new system of belief.

Michael Ruse is the Lucyle T. Werkmeister Professor of Philosophy at Florida State University. He formerly taught at the University of Guelph in Ontario, Canada for 35 years. In 1986, he was elected as a Fellow of both the Royal Society of Canada and the American Association for the Advancement of Science. He has received honorary doctorates from the University of Bergen, Norway (1990), McMaster University, Ontario, Canada (2003) and the University of New Brunswick, Fredericton, New Brunswick, Canada (2007). In September 2014 he was made an Honorary Doctor of Science by University College London.

Ruse was a key witness for the plaintiff in the 1981 test case (*McLean v. Arkansas*) of the state law permitting the teaching of "creation science" in the Arkansas school system. The federal judge ruled that the state law was unconstitutional. Ruse delivered some of the 2001 Gifford Lectures in Natural Theology at the University of Glasgow.

---

**9. Ecological Theology and Evolutionary Theory: Pierre Teilhard de Chardin's Mystical Engagement with Evolution - Rachel Knight-Messenger, University of Saint Michael's College**

This paper seeks to contribute to the conference theme of "energizing communities" by considering how theology can engage with evolutionary theory in a positive way that can contribute to the development of ecological theology and ecological ethics. It is often difficult for Christian communities to engage with scientific communities, particularly on the topic of creation and evolutionary theory, yet engagement with the scientific community has become essential for ecological theology. In fact, scholars such as Thomas Berry and Gayle E. Woloschak have argued that ecological theology can only be improved upon through a proper understanding of the role of evolution within the cosmos. This paper will focus on how Pierre Teilhard de Chardin (1881-1955), a Jesuit priest, theologian and scientist, offers a way for Christianity to engage with scientific communities regarding the topic of evolution by approaching evolution through the lens of mysticism. In fact, through Teilhard's mystical appreciation of the cosmos and evolution, he comes to a greater awareness of the sacredness of creation and the presence of God within the cosmos. His own faith and spirituality is strengthened when he sees the relationship between God and the

evolutionary process of creation. This is particularly evident in his realization that Christ is the 'goal' of evolution when he states that "...the *Christ of Revelation* is none other than the *Omega of Evolution*" (*The Heart of Matter*). This paper will focus on examining Teilhard's own mystical understanding of evolution and the cosmos, while also considering some of the ways that Teilhard's evolutionary mysticism can be incorporated into ecological theology and ecological ethics. Through his mystical understanding of the cosmos and creation, Teilhard demonstrates how a mystical approach to evolution that encompasses a cosmic Christology may not only contribute to the development of ecological theology and ethics, but can also offer a way to help bridge some of the divisions between theological and scientific communities.

#### **10. 'It's Kind of Like Dating Around...': Why Young Mennonites Are Not Getting Baptized - Peter Epp, Canadian Mennonite University**

Using constructivist grounded theory as theological practice and inquiry, along with interviews with eleven 17-25-year-old unbaptized Mennonites who identify as Christian and attend universities in Winnipeg, this study offers a thick description of why young Mennonites identify as Christian but have not chosen to participate in believers baptism. Employing a marriage analogy often invoked by the interviewees themselves, the study explores how young adults explain their decision not to be baptized in ways that we would expect them to talk about marriage: Baptism is important, they say, so they want to make sure they "get it right," and "now is not a good time for that." In turn, the paper suggests helpful new ways for churches and young Mennonites to think about baptism. For instance, when studied in light of this research, what new insights might institutional faith communities and young Christians find in the Gospel narratives of Jesus' baptism, the primary Scripture passage referenced by interviewees? Also, how might the stories and reflections of those who have not chosen to be baptized into Mennonite faith communities help us to see the way in which broader Western social trends have quietly been influencing Canadian Christians and churches?

---

#### **Joint Lecture: Crossing the Ocean of Indifference: Refugees and the Summons to Canadians" - Mary Jo Leddy - Earth Sciences 162, 7:30 - 9:30 p.m.**

*Jointly sponsored by the Canadian Theological Society, the Canadian Society for the Study of Religion, the Canadian Society of Patristic Studies, and the Canadian Society of Biblical Studies. Financial support for this session was provided by the Federation for the Humanities and Social Sciences and the Canadian Corporation for Studies in Religion.*

Mary Jo Leddy B.A.; B.Ed.; M.A.; Ph.D is well known for her work with refugees in Toronto's Romero House. She has been its director since 1991. She is also Adjunct Professor, Regis College, University of Toronto. Active member of the Ontario Sanctuary Coalition and PEN Canada, a Journalist and writer. In 1973, she was the founding editor of the Catholic New Times. She is author of the books "Say to the Darkness We Beg to Differ" (Lester and Orpen Denys, finalist City of Toronto Book Award), *Reweaving Religious Life: Beyond the Liberal Model* (Twenty Third Publications, 1990), At

the Border Called Hope: Where Refugees are Neighbours (HarperCollins, 1997 and finalist for the Trillium Award, Radical Gratitude (Orbis Books, 2002), "Our Friendly Local Terrorist" (Between the Lines 2010) and "The Other Face of God: When the Stranger Calls Us Home" (Orbis 2011). The recipient of a Ph.D. in philosophy from the University of Toronto with a thesis entitled "The Event of the Holocaust and the Philosophical Reflections of Hannah Arendt." She studied under the direction of Emil Fackenheim, she is currently a Senior Fellow at Massey College, University of Toronto. Board Member PEN Canada and Massey College. After thirty years as a member of the Roman Catholic Sisters of Our Lady of Sion, she left the congregation in 1994. Leddy received the Human Relations Award of the Canadian Council of Christians and Jews (1987), the Ontario Citizenship Award (1993), and the Order of Canada (1996).

Dr. Leddy has received several honorary doctorates, including an LL.D. from York University, a D.Litt. from Mount St. Vincent University, an LL.D. from Windsor, a D.Litt. from Waterloo, a D.D. from Saint Andrew's and a D.M. from Catholic Theological Union, Chicago.

---

Tuesday May 31, 2016

**11. *Naw'qinwixw*; theology of inculturation of the faith - Catherine Caufield, Augustana Campus of the University of Alberta**

Revealing and documenting what went horribly wrong in the context of colonization and particularly residential schools is important for the historical record. The high degree of complexity of our multifaceted history includes stories of Native and non-Natives who served in remote areas of Canada/Alberta before the turn of the twentieth century within what, due to national and international politics, came to be primarily Anglophone settlement moving west. My experience as a non-Catholic participant-observer at an Aboriginal Ministries conference puzzled me, because what I saw there contradicted my reified conceptualizations of Catholicism and the dynamics between Aboriginals and clergy. Discourses *outside* of the Aboriginal communities and parishes that were represented at the conference—discourses that were familiar and comfortable for me—were single-stories strongly associated with the qualities of oppressor and oppressed. Yet it was clear at the various gatherings inside the conference that those dichotomous categories lacked nuance and were in fact deeply varied, complicated, sometimes overlapping, and definitely not neatly separated into victim and victimizer. Conversations seemed to indicate that Oblates had transformed the Canadian north through advocacy work and building infrastructure such as hospitals, schools, cooperatives, and communication networks—and that the north had also transformed them. My beginning experiences in this fraught field indicate a bi-lateral, rather than uni-lateral, dynamic. In this talk I explore an aspect of this complex situation through my research into *naw'qinwixw*, Catholic theology of inculturation and its relationship to missionary work in Alberta.

**12. Ecclesiology Beyond the Borders of Church: How Skaters, a Skateboard Community, and a Skatepark Energize Theological Engagement on Ecclesiology. John Berard, Durham University**

Over the past few decades there has been a growing critique of the tendency of contemporary ecclesiology to frame its discourse through what Nicholas Healey called “blueprint ecclesiologies.” These are the images, metaphors or models that tend to be abstract, systematized, or idealistic accounts of what the church should be and should look like. What has emerged from that critique is a turn to the concrete, the ordinary, and the particular to better understand how cultural situations shape lived faith and ultimately the church. This amounts to an ethnographic turn in methodology by theologians with the capacity for new theological thinking about contemporary ecclesiology. This paper reports on my ethnographic research with skateboarders and their community, in order to investigate the ecclesial and theological significance of the longest running indoor skate park in Canada.

### **13. *Taashikaywin* and the Church that Lost its Place - Deanna Zantingh, Canadian Mennonite University**

Throughout the colonial era, errors in Christian thinking led to the displacement of people from land, and then the subsequent reshaping of identities and lands. These acts have left us with an impoverished Christian performance that plays out within this logic of displacement. It has caused chaos within Indigenous communities as well as thwarted its now basic call to embodied Christian community known by its radical love. We face, in the wake of the colonial reordering of peoples and places, the theological mistake of displacement that has left many communities, not energized, but in cycles of chaos and non-communion. In this presentation, I will discuss the reorienting nature of friendship with a First Nations community in Northern Ontario upon my Christian understanding of the world by drawing on my qualitative research projects with them listening to Ojibway conceptions of land, identity and place. I seek to privilege these voices because, without their perspectives, it remains almost impossible to witness the theological mistake of displacement and its far-reaching effects. We need to hear *Taashikayawin*—the place we belong—and the work to understand what its presence or displacement has meant for the formation of identity and might still mean for the possibility of re-energizing our communities.

### **14. Bringing Our Gifts: Equity, Mutuality, and Intergenerational Solidarity in Congregations - Cory Seibel, Central Baptist Church**

The contemporary North American religious landscape includes a number of vibrant multigenerational congregations that enjoy a strong sense of cohesion among members of multiple generations. This landscape also encompasses many congregations in which relations between people of differing generations are marked by ambivalence or tension. In some cases, the lack of mutuality between the generations has been accompanied by painful divisions or the quiet departure of one or more generational groups from the church. This paper will analyze these dynamics by employing the sociological concept of *intergenerational solidarity*, a term that refers to the experience of cohesion between people of multiple generations. More specifically, this paper will focus upon the sociological assertion that an equitable exchange of resources is one key factor that strengthens solidarity in intergenerational settings. When applied to the life of multigenerational congregations, this concept helps to highlight the question of whose contributions are welcome within the church and whose are not. People of all generations have been empowered by God's Spirit and endowed with gifts for the purpose of building up the church. However, in some churches, specific generational groups exercise control while the members of other generations are disempowered and discouraged from participating fully in important aspects of congregational life. When this occurs, the mutual exchange of God-given spiritual resources is disrupted. In turn, the experience of intergenerational solidarity within the congregation is undermined. This paper will advance a constructive theological vision of the local church as a vibrant community in which intergenerational solidarity is strengthened through the equitable, mutual exchange of God-given resources. Rooted in a practical theology

methodology, this paper is part of a larger project devoted to exploring the characteristics of intergenerationally “sticky” churches.

**15. Divine Kenosis as Discipleship: Building the Human Community out of Mercy - Jean-Pierre Fortin, Université de Sherbrooke**

In *Mercy: The Essence of the Gospel and the Key to Christian Life*, Walter Kasper ascribes primacy, among the attributes of God, to mercy. According to him, “God’s mercy assumes first place in God’s self-revelation in the history of salvation” because “mercy is the externally visible and effectively active aspect of the essence of God.” God’s mercy liberates humankind from the yoke of sin and guilt, for a new existence as instrument and channel for grace. Divine mercy is thus made incarnate in the lives of saints “who, in the dark night of faith, and in God’s abandonment of Jesus on the cross, were able to endure, in a substitutionary way, for those who are caught in the night of unbelief and distance from God.”

The proposed communication will argue that Walter Kasper’s defence of the primacy of mercy finds both confirmation and support in Hans Urs von Balthasar’s Christology and Teresa of Calcutta’s discipleship. Balthasar’s systematic articulation of the category of kenosis provides coherence and grounding to Kasper’s analysis. Teresa of Calcutta’s holy life provides experiential concreteness and depth to Kasper’s description of Christian discipleship. In the humanity of Jesus, Balthasar finds full disclosure of the divine. Jesus transformed the humiliation, forsakenness, death, and defeat he endured into the most powerful locus for the manifestation of absolute, undefeated, and indefeasible love. Teresa of Calcutta’s lifelong dedication to the poor strikingly instantiates how, amidst hopelessness, the God of Christ empowers his disciples to have a share in his redeeming suffering. In the grace of obedience, she was led to experience spiritual desolation to bring in the slums the God working out miracles of mercy.

With Balthasar’s kenotic theology and in Teresa of Calcutta’s living ministry, mercy is shown to reflect most accurately the essence and power of the triune God, reaching out to and providing solace to all in need. The faithful disciple perceives Jesus Christ in the person of the helpless outsider empowering her to serve him. The Church is built by being open to finding God outside her own confines, becoming a sacrament of divine salvation by welcoming, healing and empowering the other in need. Mercy stands as the substance and embodiment of a Christian faith without borders, where strangers find God in the act of assisting one another, building up the community by attending to and caring for the divine in their midst.

**16. ‘Don’t Frack with Our Water’: Conflicting or Converging Narratives in Traditional Indigenous and Christian Opposition to Hydro-Fracking for Methane - Derek Simon, St. Thomas University**

Amidst the diverse types and means of fossil fuel extraction, hydraulic-fracturing for shale-embedded methane represents a separate extreme energy sector for the neo-liberal petro-state in many jurisdictions in Canada and the USA, even while some jurisdictions at the provincial and state levels have imposed either moratoriums or bans. The risk of harm and

damages from hydro-fracking operations related to freshwater contamination and water security are widely documented and contentiously debated at community, regional and even national levels. Amidst the diverse secular and spiritual discourses that have given voice to narratives of resistance to fracking, traditionalist indigenous and christian earthkeeping narratives have offered contrasting accounts for their opposition to fracking industries that violate ecological, indigenous and human rights to freshwater while conducting business.

While several recent case-studies and theoretical studies of environmental alliances involving indigenous and christian/secular activist networks suggest a renewed partnership based on common ground and shared interests, the differences between traditionalist indigenous and christian earthkeeping discourses opposed to hydraulic-fracturing are hard to overlook and ignore.

Traditionalist Indigenous discourses tend to argue a normative case for a ban on hydraulic fracturing that is permanent and universal. The purpose of applying a ban for all times and places is to protect the sacredness of water and prevent the inevitable harm to the circles of kinship related to water should industrial fracking proceed. By contrast, environmentalist christian discourses argue a conditional case for a precautionary moratorium on hydraulic fracturing but only until such a time as the means of extraction are known to be safe; the tradeoffs in costs and benefits are weighted towards benefits or at least equalized; and, where needed, accommodation agreements and compensation packages are in place to reduce the impact of damages to economic, environmental and public health for at-risk populations.

### **17. Justification by Grace and Cultural/Religious Pluralism - Don Schweitzer, St. Andrew's College**

Canada's collective identity has been characterized by cultural and a relative religious pluralism since confederation. In recent decades this cultural and religious pluralism has been dramatically increased by immigration and the struggles of First Nations peoples for self-determination. Cultural and religious pluralism poses a twofold challenge to religions and theology. It requires a relativization of the claims of one's own religion and culture so as to make space for others that are different. It also necessitates discovering within one's own religion and culture the grounds for a universal affirmation of the human rights and dignity of other people and for the recognition of other religions and cultures.

This presentation will explore the contribution justification by grace can make to this. It will first examine the challenges that cultural and religious pluralism pose to Christian theology and faith. It will then examine how justification by grace relativizes the moral claims of all religions and cultures, including one's own, by setting these within an overarching framework in which every person is justified before God, regardless of who they are, what they believe or how they live. It will then show how by doing this justification by grace provides a basis for respect for others, which includes an affirmation of their human rights and dignity. It will then examine how justification by grace is a transitional moment leading towards the renewal of God in all things. It will then show how this orientation of justification by grace provides a basis for the recognition of other cultures and religions, and their critique. In this way justification by grace supports an orientation towards religious and

cultural pluralism that Serene Jones has called “bounded openness.” By providing a basis for this orientation justification by grace can help churches and Christians relate to cultural and religious pluralism in a constructive and critical way.

### **18. Examining Pathways of Theological Engagement in Water Ethics in the Anthropocene - Tom McAuley, St. Paul University**

In the face of a growing world water crisis, water governance and decision-making has come under increasing scrutiny in recent decades. Decisions about freshwater use have serious consequences for humans and ecosystems. A body of literature on "water ethics" has developed over the last several decades. This literature also critiques current paradigms of water management from diverse ethical perspectives and horizons. Engagement with water management, whether global, regional, or local, requires adequate interdisciplinary analysis with disciplines such as hydrology, ecology, and economics. However, this alone is not enough. It also requires understanding the involved human agent as moral decision-maker. Theology thus has a role to play. This paper will examine several paths of theological engagement in water ethics, one of which is the 2015 encyclical, *'Laudato Si'*: Care for our Common Home. It will look at several parameters such as 'theological vision' as well as the challenges of engagement in the light of existing problems.

---

### **Panel: The Challenge of Religious Freedom: Past, Present and Future**

Michael Attridge, Associate Professor, University of St Michael's College (Toronto)

Michael Buttrey, PhD Candidate, Regis College (Toronto)

Darren Dias, Associate Professor, University of St Michael's College (Toronto)

Nicholas Olkovich, Assistant Professor, University of St. Michaels College (Toronto)

In countries where there is no religious freedom or else where there exists an established religion, the question of religious freedom is more obvious. However, in a liberal democracy like Canada, it is easy take religious freedom for granted, without historical perspective or critical reflection. This panel discussion critically engages the question of what religious freedom means in democratic context by examining the particular problematic of religious freedom in the Canadian Roman Catholic context; through the contribution of Canadians at the Second Vatican Council; contemporary political theologies; and through the categories of conscience and cooperation.

Our first panelist will present a historical sketch of a Canadian form of liberalism that can be traced to France to Henri-Dominique Lacordaire and then developed by the Canadian Province of the Friars of the Order of Preachers from the 1930s to the 1960s. Significant characteristics of this form of liberalism would be validated by the Second Vatican Council's Decree on Religious Freedom.

Our second presenter will offer an overview of the Canadian contributions to the religious freedom debate at Vatican II, contributions that were among the most progressive and



influential at the Council. He will then explore whether these were motivated by theological values, social values, or political values for Canadian church and society.

Although Christians reject individualist readings of religious freedom, they disagree about the role of the church in shaping the cultural meanings and values that contextualize the juridical or civil right to religious freedom. Our third presenter will examine the contemporary trend in Catholic theology to reject natural law as a basis for public philosophizing and will argue that this rejection is misguided and stands in tension with the church's preferential option for constitutional democracy.

Our fourth presenter will conclude the panel by connecting our discussion of religious freedom to the traditional categories of conscience and cooperation. Should social respect for the consciences of draftees and medical professionals be extended to teachers as well? Does the protection of conscience claims truly represent a threat to the fairness and accessibility of public institutions? These and other questions will be explored in dialogue with the other panelists and by drawing on recent work by Cathleen Kaveny and Spencer Durland.

### **19. Christian Martyrdom and the Unity of the Church - Jeremy Bergen, Conrad Grebel University, University of Waterloo**

Pope John Paul II began his landmark encyclical on ecumenism with a claim that Christian martyrs both Catholic and non-Catholic offer “the most powerful proof that every factor of division can be transcended and overcome in the total gift of self for the sake of the Gospel” (*Ut Unum Sint*, §1). The conviction that in martyrdom there may be a dynamic impulse towards the unity of divided churches has been echoed by a wide variety of theologians, ecumenists, and church leaders. This line of thinking is typically built on both a theological claim about the intrinsic link between the martyr and Jesus Christ, especially his death, and on a historical recognition that especially in the past century, Christians have been united by common threats: dictatorships, totalitarian regimes, and political repression.

Nevertheless, many martyrs in the Christian tradition appear to us to be rigid and inflexible. Their postures thus seem to be in significant tension with the sense that ecumenical reconciliation requires dialogue and viewing the faith from multiple perspectives. Furthermore, as the case of Archbishop Romero highlights, whether one was killed because of “politics” or because of actions linked with “Christian faith,” may be highly contested among Christians. Moreover, those “confessional” martyrs killed in the turmoil of Reformation-era violence are more obviously barriers to Christian unity than a resource for it. Finally, since Christians are not agreed on just who Jesus Christ is, nor on what his death means, we might expect that accounts of what it means for a martyr to die like Jesus may also presuppose and reinforce divergent, even incompatible, positions. Martyrdom may well reinforce and intensify the divisions that exist.

In this presentation—an outline of larger project—I will examine the promise and the problems of the *stories* of Christian martyrs as resources for ecumenical reconciliation. Recognizing that martyrs are “made” not in the moment of death but in how church communities remember and frame stories of suffering and death, I pay particular attention to how contemporary discourses about martyrs from the earliest centuries to the most recent bear ecumenical potential. As a scholar

committed to advancing the visible unity of Christ's Church, I want the pope's thesis to be true. But the cause of unity will not be served without a critical examination of the particular opportunities, barriers, and roadmaps.

## **20. The "Preferential Option" and Grounds for Interfaith Solidarity with Indigenous Peoples in Canada - Benjamín Luján, University of Saint Michael's College**

According to Tink Tinker, his theology of sovereignty for North American native peoples is incompatible with Gustavo Gutiérrez's "preferential option for the poor," which for the Peruvian theologian constitutes the heart of any liberationist-centered theology; Tinker contends that the language of "the poor" presupposes a class-based view of society that is at odds with the social structures of native communities. I will argue, however, that Gutiérrez's "preferential option" appeals to a much broader notion of poverty, based not on social class but on vulnerability and need; thus, Gutiérrez's emphasis on the "preferential option" is not only compatible with Tinker's own views but it can in fact complement and strengthen them.

For Gutiérrez the "preferential option for the poor" ultimately is not exclusively a Christian practice; rather, it originates from the moral judgments of any person who seeks to act responsibly in the face of injustice and suffering – judgments that he/she performs as part of a broader commitment to others that grounds and colours every aspect of his/her life. Gutiérrez (and indeed the Christian tradition as a whole, Gutiérrez claims) sees that commitment as ultimately referring to a gratuitous effect – the "fruits" – of experiencing God's grace – the "Holy Spirit." This occurs in the midst of our ordinary life, and the commitment Gutiérrez refers to means seeking to live in harmony with it. Hence, for Gutiérrez the preferential option for the poor is fundamentally a practice that can already be found in the concrete efforts of peoples that put the most vulnerable first, even at the expense of bringing struggles and difficulties to their own lives. Such efforts occur in diverse contexts, and due to their shared ultimate ground, I will suggest, they can constitute a point of encounter for peoples of different faiths.

In the Canadian multicultural context and in the current situation of increasing religious intolerance worldwide, it is especially important to bring together people of all "settler" groups to practice inter-religious solidarity with the native peoples in Canada. No religious person can remain indifferent to the urgent needs and often-neglected aspirations of native peoples in North America; this is due to ultimately religious reasons, regardless of the specific tradition someone is informed by. I will suggest, then, that Tinker and Gutiérrez's ideas can *together* provide both theoretical support and practical guidelines for a truly interreligious solidarity with aboriginal peoples in North America.

## **21. The Good of the City: Churches Working Together in Edmonton - Carol Penner, Lendrum Mennonite Brethren Church**

What are the theological motivations of Christians from different denominations as they create non-profit organizations that benefit a city? This presentation will share the results of interviewing five individuals who have been involved in fifty years of ecumenical co-operation in Edmonton (1965-2015). Christians co-operated here to form many diverse organizations that served the greater good, such as Edmonton Recycling to Edmonton

Mennonite Centre for Newcomers. Some of these non-profit organizations have remained tied to their Christian roots, others have become independent. This presentation will focus on the theological foundations of the people who have made a real difference in the quality of life in Edmonton. My interviews will conclude by asking my interviewees what kind of theology they think is needed to motivate Christians in the coming fifty years.

The problem my scholarship engages: Why do Christians become engaged with their urban environment? Christians from diverse backgrounds have co-operated together; are the theological reasons they name for their work similar or different? This theological history has not been documented, and some of the people who have done the work are in their 70s and 80s. My research will also try to determine whether the driving force was an ecclesiology of engagement, and thus denominationally driven, or whether individuals acted independently of their larger churches. This research might hold clues as to how to motivate Christians to continue to engage their city in the coming fifty years.

The contribution I plan to make: The theological motivation of the groundbreakers who dream of and create organizations is something that is not often documented. Institutional histories look at the facts, but rarely the theology behind their inception. By interviewing five influential people who have been involved in this sort of work in Edmonton, I will be exploring a practical theology that has made a real difference in this city.

## **22. Rainbow of Redemption: A Metaphorical Supplement to Contextual Theology from John Milbank's Notion of Participation - Jesse Smith, St. Paul's University**

This paper engages the contextual theology of Marilyn Legge, especially as outlined in *The Grace of Difference* and relates its notion of difference to the celebration of diversity found in the symbology of the pride flag. Over an against this visual metaphor it will propose prismatic rainbow imagery encodes a properly theological anthropology

Legge states "theology cannot deal with so-called universal experience, because we are unable to compute such infinite varieties of human contexts". Similarly, Milbank criticizes rights-based theology as inherently Kantian which holds "Rational, moral behaviour is universalizable behaviour which treats every rational being as equivalent in his formal freedom and every object as equivalent in its ability to be possessed, together with its standardized exchangeability." The shared concern for the dangers of a universal or systematic understanding of the human experience is my bridging point. I contend that the diversity enshrined in the pride flag, which congruent with Legge's valorization of difference is incompatible with Milbank's.

Ultimately I will prefer Milbank's reading of difference and suggest that Legge faces the same challenge of the relating of difference and the negative rights underpinning the flag's symbology. I offer instead a rainbow metaphor that uses prismatic imagery to speak of difference, finitude/infinity and theosis.

The engagement with contextual theology is an extension of my thesis scholarship which works with the Radical Orthodox methodologies of Milbank and others, specifically relating to the human person and Creation. The decision to contrast a British scholar with a Canadian one is intentional and aims at fruitful cross-pollination.

**Wednesday June 1, 2016**

**23. The Challenge of Love: A Social and Theological Appraisal of the Situation of Catholic Schools in Alberta - Brett Fawcett, Newman Theological College**

Although the right to a publicly-funded separate school system is currently enshrined in constitutional law, a vocal group of Albertans are calling for the defunding of the Catholic school system based on questions of religious liberty, a situation aggravated by the recent controversy over Gay-Straight Alliances and transgender rights.

This presentation will deal with the question of Canadian identity raised in this debate, with specific reference to George Parkin Grant's argument that Canada's national identity was based on an instinct of preservation of a conservative civilization, which was being threatened by a technocratic liberalization and homogeneity; specific reference will be made to his own essay on the role of a public Catholic school system within the new technological society. It will argue that he was right in arguing that Canada's national character is safeguarded by the preservation of the separate school system. The presentation will also look at the history of the system we have in place in the light of Grant's analysis, showing how the current problem of tension between the secular and the Catholic schools bears affinity to the earlier situation of a Catholic school system requiring protection against a Protestant homogenization during the time of Egerton Ryerson. An examination of the Catholic system's role in energizing communities, particularly given the recent impetus to social and environmental justice given by Pope Francis, will follow, and will conclude with an analysis of the LGBTQ question in the light of John Paul II's Theology of the Body and the example of compassion within orthodoxy given by Pope Francis.

**24. "Creative Energy": The Role of the Erotic in Approaches to Ecological Crisis - Michael Ross, University of Saint Michael's College**

What does sex have to do with the tar sands? Or more broadly, what role does human sexuality – or Eros – play in our relationship with the natural world and the ecological crisis? Over the past few decades, ecotheological movements have made invaluable contributions to religious traditions and the wider Earth community, yet the sexual and erotic dimension of human existence and the ecological crisis has been a rather minor theme. Meanwhile, in the last few decades we have also seen a proliferation of new voices in sexual ethics – representing various distinct experiences such as feminist, gay, black, liberation and disabled – which have challenged traditional Roman Catholic and Protestant models of sexuality. This work has also made invaluable contributions to religious traditions and yet offers minimal reflection on the ecological or cosmological implications of its insights. Is there a way to create a dialogue between these voices?

In this presentation, I argue that these movements can be integrated in a fruitful manner. I will review various ecologically-minded theologians who offer important building blocks for

this dialogue: Sallie McFague's sense of the earth as God's "body," Daniel Spencer's "Gay and Gaia," and treatments of the erotic in the work of Leonardo Boff or Mark I. Wallace all offer useful ways of relating ecology and sexuality. Another important voice in this dialogue is ecotheologian Thomas Berry who, while not addressing sexuality directly in his work, offers a way of reframing the erotic and its role in our relationship with the natural world. At the core of our ecological crisis is an outdated cosmology, theological anthropology and story that underlies not only the degradation of the natural world but also the body and the sexual dimension of human experience. Berry's "new story" offers a way to reimagine the sexual impulse not as the negative result of cosmic Fall but as a force that drives the evolutionary process. Drawing in particular on his concepts of cosmic allurements and "creative energy," I will explore how a deeper appreciation for the erotic might enhance ecological consciousness and action.

Along the way, I will grapple with the fact that the Christian churches have by and large been followers, and not leaders, in both environmental and sexual diversity movements. I will also explore the tension between cosmologies or unified (hegemonic?) stories and particular sexualities, suggesting that the evolutionary story is fundamentally a story about diversity

### **25. Title: Marriage Equality? Articulating the "More" in a Christian Theology of Marriage in the Anglican Church of Canada's "This Holy Estate" - Stephen Martin, The King's University**

Abstract: In 2014, The Anglican Church of Canada's Commission on the Marriage Canon requested submissions from the church's membership on changing its Canon XXI to allow for the marriage of same-sex couples. Some respondents narrated the moment as "bowing" to impulses within Canadian culture, reflected in the 2005 Civil Marriage Act. This compromised the church's witness. Same-sex couples civilly married were not (and could not be) considered married in a Christian sense. Situating culture in a narrative of decline from Christian origins, the call of the church as witness mandated refusal to change its canon. Other respondents argued that in contemplating change the church was moving with the (enlightened) times, reflected in the 2005 Act. This was also a matter of witness to the culture, though not against but for the values of openness, tolerance, and inclusivity. The secular law had given the church a mandate to change, though no true theological rationale.

In the Commission's view, neither the latter, more univocal understanding of civil (as) Christian marriage, nor the former, more equivocal understanding of civil (vs) Christian marriage were satisfactory in projecting a way of faithfulness for the church. A responsible theology of marriage was thus required to enable the church to reflect deeply on the questions of the moment. Such a theology could neither simply reject the recognition of civil marriage, including same-sex marriage, in the church. Nor could it simply, under the rubric of "marriage equality," affirm same-sex civil marriage as Christian marriage.

The Commission sketched out a direction for such a theology by relating civil and Christian marriage analogically. Christian marriage has an "excess" lacking in civil marriage. But this "excess" also took same-sex marriage up into the understanding of Christian marriage. This was done through a second analogy between marriage as creation ordinance and marriage

as discipleship. As such it participates in the redemptive mystery of Christ and the church—a mystery in which the partners move beyond gendered polarization. Thinking analogically was presented as a more faithful way for the church to engage the challenge presented by the Civil Marriage Act than the *contra mundi* or accommodationist views.

As [full disclosure] one of the authors of *This Holy Estate*, I am interested in exploring critically this last assertion in dialogue with theologians from other Christian traditions and convictions. My paper will present the document's Rationale, and invite reflective responses.

## **26. Slow Down, Pay Attention: Putting Ivan Illich's Energy Ethics in Theological Perspective - Graham Baker, McMaster University**

In the early 1970s, when many of his contemporaries were preoccupied by the opportunity afforded by an artificially created scarcity of oil to seek out and develop more sustainable sources of energy, Ivan Illich countered by arguing for a fundamental contradiction between increased energy consumption (no matter the source) and justice in a society. Increased per capita energy use, Illich suggested in *Energy and Equity*, is healthy for the social body only up to a certain limit, after which such use becomes counterproductive and, indeed, inequitable. Narrowing in on transportation as an example of an energy intensive industry in need of a radical reconfiguration, Illich went so far as to argue for a universal speed limit of 15 mph as a means of preserving the capacity for all people to get where they need to go under their own power.

Illich's work in economics and in other social sciences has been read and commented upon by scholars and experts, and his contribution may be judged by standards appropriate to those fields. Yet Ivan Illich was not merely an astute social critic. He was also a Catholic priest and a man evidently possessed of a deep and abiding spiritual conviction. In a series of interviews given to David Cayley of the CBC conducted toward the end of his life, Illich was able to communicate, in broad strokes, the way in which a theological vision that had been taking shape over the course of his long writing career had given him a deeper insight into his own critical, secular work from the 1970s.

Illich does not explicitly refer to *Energy and Equity* during those interviews. Thus, the work of this presentation will be to reexamine his argument in favor of limits on energy consumption in the light of his later theological claims. More specifically, I will demonstrate how the theological history that Illich articulates to Cayley serves to account for the rise of energy intensive institutions as well as how Illich's insights into the meaning of the Gospel story of the Good Samaritan provide the context for an alternative imagining of a communal life characterized by respect for human persons as fundamentally *embodied* creatures.

## **27. What Will the Neighbours Think? The Problems with Judging Scandal in Catholic Schools - Graham McDonough**

This presentation makes a critical examination of the stance taken by Canada's largest publicly funded Catholic school system to oppose the formation of Gay-Straight Alliances (GSAs). As a significant part of this opposition was based on a claim that GSAs would cause

*scandal*, this paper demonstrates that the conceptualization of scandal employed in this opposition reflects a selectively narrow theological and biblical perspective that overlooks scandal's greater scope, and so leads to a problematic epistemic and moral deduction. Its final section demonstrates the necessity of incorporating a broader theological perspective on scandal in policy formulation and decision-making in Catholic schools.

Education is an important feature of Catholicism, and so Catholic schools are an important institution in the Church. As an ecclesial institution, Catholic schools are expected to develop and enact policies that are theologically sound. Theological soundness here refers not only to the acknowledgment of doctrine, but also being well grounded in professional knowledge, students' lives, and of course the life of the school.

The argument begins by demonstrating the conceptual unsteadiness in current definitions of scandal, like those present in the Catholic *Catechism* and in the work of scholars like Germain Grisez. It shows the difficulties inherent in identifying scandal's presence and determining whether the situation in question really presents an occasion for others to sin. One such difficulty emerges from the fact that not all varieties of scandal are sinful; some scandals rightfully challenge persons to change by their very disruption of conventional thought and practice in the Church and society. For demonstration of this point I problematize both Grisez's conceptualization of scandal, as well as the Ontario Bishops' reference to Paul's First Letter to the Corinthians in their assessment of GSAs. Next, the argument shows how theologians Enda McDonagh and Bernard Häring articulate an expanded but unfortunately overlooked conceptualization of scandal that is preferable on epistemological, moral, and existential grounds. This assessment leads to a conclusion that this reconceptualization allows a more robust theological, pedagogical, and pastoral approach to adjudicating relevant events in Catholic institutions like schools. The conclusion maintains that what traditional definitions might have summarily proscribed as sinful threats to conventional morality might sometimes be better understood as phenomena or initiatives that signify an occasion for reasonable experimentation, in need of ongoing assessment of their efficacy for educative growth.

## **28. "If your Brother Sins Against You: Fossil Fuel Divestment and Ecclesial Ethics" - Dane Neufeld, All Saints Anglican Church, Fort McMurray**

This paper deals with fossil fuel divestment as a question of ecclesial ethics and the issue of ecclesial sin and restoration. By engaging three Church divestment documents—the Church of England, The United Church of Canada and the Anglican Diocese Montreal—I will argue that divesting Churches have failed to provide a coherent theological impetus for an action that clearly affects fellow Christians.

While fossil fuel development is not an issue exclusively internal to ecclesial life, fossil fuel companies are not purely external either for the simple reason that Christians work within the industry, in related industries and live within regions the industry supports. The Church of England divestment documents has suggested, for example, that oil sands companies "are unlikely to make a meaningful contribution to the transition to a low carbon economy" ("Climate Change: The Policy of the National Investing Bodies of the Church of England",

20).” For this reason the time for shareholder engagement has come to an end. However, the time ecclesial engagement has not even begun.

In this paper I will consider fossil fuel divestment in the context of Matthew 18:17-19. Jesus’ famous words provide at the very least a template for confronting sinful actions within a Christian community that involves multiple private and public stages. By treating fossil companies as entities entirely external to ecclesial life Church bodies have missed an opportunity to engage Christians in the industry and to restore these polarized relationships. Instead divestment has exaggerated divisions within certain Church bodies and created moral instability and uncertainty for Christians within the industry.

The Episcopalian Theologian Philip Turner, in *Christian Ethics and the Church*, has argued that the primary concern of ecclesial ethics should be the common life of the Church, or the character of Christian’s mutual love. Building on Turner’s insight I suggest fossil fuel divestment does little in this regard to enhance the Church’s moral witness in the world. Rather, in the midst of adversarial and contentious debates about climate change, the witness of Christian communities to the world could be as leaders in collaborative, patient and careful forms of mutual engagement.